


AMERICAN SOCIETY OF ACCESS PROFESSIONALS, INC.

## American Society of Access Professionals

### Overview of FOIA's 9 Exemptions

Brent Evitt  
&  
Martha Wagner Murphy

National Training Conference  
July 19, 2022



1

---

---

---

---

---

---



---

---

AMERICAN SOCIETY OF ACCESS PROFESSIONALS, INC.

## Nine Exemptions

FOIA is a disclosure statute that provides for the withholding of "exempt" information from public disclosure.

2

---

---

---

---

---

---


---

---

AMERICAN SOCIETY OF ACCESS PROFESSIONALS, INC.

## Foreseeable Harm Standard

- Agencies "shall withhold information"... only if the agency reasonably foresees that disclosure would:
  1. Harm an interest protected by an exemption, or
  2. Disclosure is prohibited by law
- Consider whether partial disclosure is possible, if full disclosure isn't possible
  - Take "reasonable steps" to segregate and release non-exempt information.



3

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

AMERICAN SOCIETY OF ACCESS PROFESSIONALS, INC.

### Exemption I Classified Records

Protects records the disclosure of which would cause harm to national security or foreign policy

Records must be properly classified under procedural & substantive requirements of current Executive Order

*asap*

4

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

AMERICAN SOCIETY OF ACCESS PROFESSIONALS, INC.

### Exemption I Classified Records

- Executive Order 13,526 establishes procedures for classifying information as either "top secret," "secret," or "confidential"
- No discretionary release
  - Courts tend to defer to agencies in determining whether disclosure would cause national security harm
  - Not all agencies have classification authority

*asap*

5

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

AMERICAN SOCIETY OF ACCESS PROFESSIONALS, INC.

### Exemption I & "Glomar"

The "Glomar" response: "neither confirm, nor deny..."

- Protects abstract fact that agency has requested records
- "Glomar" requires a formal denial
- Concept is applicable to information that may be withheld under other FOIA exemptions

*asap*

6

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

AMERICAN SOCIETY OF ACCESS PROFESSIONALS, INC.

**Exemption 2**  
**Information Must be Related to "Personnel" Rules & Practices**

Information must relate to:

- "...the selection, placement, and training of employees ... the formulations of policies, procedures, and relations with employees or their representatives"
- Deals with "employee relations or human resources," re "conditions of employment in federal agencies ... such matters as hiring and firing, work rules and discipline, compensation and benefits"

*asap*

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

7

AMERICAN SOCIETY OF ACCESS PROFESSIONALS, INC.

**Exemption 2**

- 3 part test applies:
  - Must be related to "personnel" rules & practices
  - Relates "solely" to those personnel rules & practices
  - Must be "internal," meaning that "the agency must typically keep the records to itself for its own use"
- May overlap with Exemption 6
- Foreseeable Harm test applies

*asap*

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

8

AMERICAN SOCIETY OF ACCESS PROFESSIONALS, INC.

**Exemption 3: Matters Specifically Protected by Other Statutes**

- Statutes must be passed into law by Congress.
  - **Subpart (A)(i):** statutes that require information to be withheld and leave the agency no discretion on the issue
  - **Subpart (A)(ii):** statutes that either provide criteria for withholding information or refer to particular matters to be withheld

*asap*

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

9

AMERICAN SOCIETY OF ACCESS PROFESSIONALS, INC.

### Exemption 3

- Your Agency's Annual Report contains the list of Exemption 3 statutes used to withhold records
- DOJ's Office of Information Policy publishes a list of Exemption 3 statutes which have been upheld by the courts:
  - [https://www.justice.gov/oip/foia-resources%23s4/statutes\\_found\\_to\\_qualify\\_under\\_exemption\\_3/download](https://www.justice.gov/oip/foia-resources%23s4/statutes_found_to_qualify_under_exemption_3/download)

*asap*

10

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

AMERICAN SOCIETY OF ACCESS PROFESSIONALS, INC.

### Exemption 4

#### Trade Secrets and Commercial or Financial Information Obtained from a Person that is Privileged or Confidential

Protects sensitive business information

*asap*

11

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

AMERICAN SOCIETY OF ACCESS PROFESSIONALS, INC.

### Exemption 4

A "trade secret" is narrowly defined as "any secret, commercially valuable plan, formula, process or device that is used for making, preparing, compounding, or processing of trade commodities, that can be said to be the end product of either innovation or substantial efforts"

*asap*

12

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

AMERICAN SOCIETY OF ACCESS PROFESSIONALS, INC.

### Exemption 4

- The information must be commercial or financial data used in the course of business and
- Is obtained from a person, and
- Is privileged or confidential

*asap*

13

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

AMERICAN SOCIETY OF ACCESS PROFESSIONALS, INC.

**Ex. 4 - Confidential – Supreme Court- Food Mktg. Inst. v. Argus Leader Media, 139 S. Ct. 915 (2019),**

- The term “confidential” meant then, as it does now, “private” or “secret.” Webster’s Seventh New Collegiate Dictionary 174 (1963).
- Contemporary dictionaries suggest two conditions that might be required for information communicated to another to be considered confidential.
  - In one sense, information communicated to another remains confidential whenever it is customarily kept private, or at least closely held, by the person imparting it.
  - In another sense, information might be considered confidential only if the party receiving it provides some assurance that it will remain secret.
- “common usage”
- Where commercial or financial information is both customarily and actually treated as private by its owner and provided to the government under an assurance of privacy, the information is “confidential” within the meaning of Exemption 4.
- Dissent – what about harm requirement?

*asap*

14

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

AMERICAN SOCIETY OF ACCESS PROFESSIONALS, INC.

### Exemption 5

- Protects inter- or intra-agency records that would be privileged in civil discovery
- 3 primary privileges protected:
  - Deliberative process privilege
  - Attorney work-product privilege
  - Attorney-client privilege

*asap*

15

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

AMERICAN SOCIETY OF ACCESS PROFESSIONALS, INC.

**Exemption 5 and Foreseeable Harm**

- Exemption 5 is a primary opportunity to apply the foreseeable harm test
- If your agency decides records may be released without causing a specific harm and without violating a law, records must be released
- The 2016 Amendments limit protection to 25 years for the deliberative process application
  - (“The deliberative process privilege shall not apply to records created 25 years or more before the date on which the records were requested.”)

*asap*

16

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

AMERICAN SOCIETY OF ACCESS PROFESSIONALS, INC.

**Exemption 5  
Deliberative Process Privilege**

- Protects the quality of agency decision-making
- Encourages frank & open agency discussion
- Prevents premature disclosure before decision is adopted
- Requires reasonable segregation; does not protect factual information

*asap*

17

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

AMERICAN SOCIETY OF ACCESS PROFESSIONALS, INC.

**Exemption 5  
Deliberative Process**

Protects information that is pre-decisional and deliberative

- makes recommendations
- expresses opinions (legal or policy)
- drafts are protected
- usually goes “up the chain of command”
- may include email

*asap*

18

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

AMERICAN SOCIETY OF ACCESS PROFESSIONALS, INC.

### Exemption 5 Attorney Work-Product

- Records prepared by an attorney or at the direction of an attorney in reasonable anticipation of litigation
- Limited to litigation and pre-litigation documents

*asap*

19

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

AMERICAN SOCIETY OF ACCESS PROFESSIONALS, INC.

### Exemption 5 Attorney Work-Product

- Once work-product, always work-product
- Even if the document contains final opinions or recommendations that later become the basis for a final agency decision
- No need to segregate factual information for release

*asap*

20

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

AMERICAN SOCIETY OF ACCESS PROFESSIONALS, INC.

### Exemption 5 Attorney-Client

What information is protected?

- Confidential communications between a client and an attorney
- Opinions given by an attorney to a client based on confidential communication, and
- Communications between attorneys that reflect client-supplied information
- No need to segregate factual information for release

*asap*

21

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

AMERICAN SOCIETY OF ACCESS PROFESSIONALS, INC.

**Exemption 6  
Clearly Unwarranted Invasion  
of Personal Privacy**

- Personnel, medical, and similar files
- Release must constitute a clearly unwarranted invasion of personal privacy
- Identifiable to an individual, not a corporate entity (except small businesses)

*asap*

22

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

AMERICAN SOCIETY OF ACCESS PROFESSIONALS, INC.

**Exemption 6  
Personal Privacy**

- Balance the individual's privacy interest against the public interest in disclosure
- Living individuals have privacy interest in not having information released about them
  - No privacy interest: Disclose
  - No expectation of privacy: Disclose
  - No public interest: Withhold

*asap*

23

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

AMERICAN SOCIETY OF ACCESS PROFESSIONALS, INC.

**Exemption 6  
Personal Privacy**

- No protection under Exemption 6 for corporations (except closely held corporations)
- Some protection for next of kin of deceased persons in "time of death" records (*Favish* Supreme Court decision\*)

\* National Archives & Records Administration v. Favish, 124 S. Ct. 1570 (2004)

*asap*

24

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---



AMERICAN SOCIETY OF ACCESS PROFESSIONALS, INC.

**Exemption 7**  
**Records Compiled for Law Enforcement**

Exemption protects 6 categories of records compiled for law enforcement purposes, if release would:

- (A) Interfere with enforcement proceedings
- (B) The right to a fair trial or impartial adjudication
- (C) Unwarranted invasion of personal privacy
- (D) Identify a confidential source
- (E) Law enforcement techniques & procedures
- (F) Endanger life or physical safety of an individual

*asap*

25

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

AMERICAN SOCIETY OF ACCESS PROFESSIONALS, INC.

**Exemption 7(A)**  
**Law Enforcement Records**

- Withhold if disclosure could reasonably be expected to interfere with a pending or prospective law enforcement proceedings
- When law enforcement proceedings are concluded, Exemption 7(A) no longer applies
  - In litigation, always review record for applicability of other exemptions

*asap*

26

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

AMERICAN SOCIETY OF ACCESS PROFESSIONALS, INC.

**Exemption 7(B)**  
**Deprive a Person of the Right to a Fair Trial or Hearing**

- Purpose: Prevent prejudicial pre-trial publicity, that could impair a court proceeding or hearing
- Compiled for law enforcement purposes
- Withhold if disclosure would:
  - deprive person of a right to a fair trial or impartial adjudication

*asap*

27

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

AMERICAN SOCIETY OF ACCESS PROFESSIONALS, INC.

### Exemption 7(C) Personal Privacy

- Compiled for a law enforcement purpose
- Disclosure “could reasonably be expected to constitute an unwarranted invasion of personal privacy”
- Lower burden of proof than Exemption 6 due to sensitivities inherent in law enforcement records
  - Same balancing test as Exemption 6

*asap*

28

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

AMERICAN SOCIETY OF ACCESS PROFESSIONALS, INC.

### Exemption 7(D) Confidential Source

- Protects all identifying information in any law enforcement record
- Additionally, in the cases of criminal or national security investigations, all information provided by the confidential sources

*asap*

29

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

AMERICAN SOCIETY OF ACCESS PROFESSIONALS, INC.

### Exemption 7(D) Confidential Source

- Purpose: Ensures that confidential sources will not be lost
  - Through retaliation (physical threats, employment, etc.), or
  - Because of past information or fear of future disclosure
  - May work with Whistleblower Protection Act

*asap*

30

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

AMERICAN SOCIETY OF ACCESS PROFESSIONALS, INC.

### Exemption 7(D) Confidential Source

- Glomar option
- If you suspect that subject is being coerced into making the request (check with subject personally)
- You will need to verify identity of any first-party confidential source requester
- Physically safeguard information

*asap*

31

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

AMERICAN SOCIETY OF ACCESS PROFESSIONALS, INC.

### Exemption 7(E) Techniques & Procedures

- Compiled for law enforcement purposes
- Withhold if disclosure could reasonably be expected to risk “circumvention of law”
  - Includes guidelines for law enforcement investigations/prosecutions if disclosure could reasonably be expected to risk circumvention of the law

*asap*

32

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

AMERICAN SOCIETY OF ACCESS PROFESSIONALS, INC.

### Exemption 7(F) Endanger Life or Physical Safety

- Compiled for law enforcement purposes
- Disclosure could reasonably be expected to “endanger life or physical safety of any individual”
  - Includes law enforcement personnel and all other persons
- Broader protection than (b)(7)(C)
  - no balancing test required
  - show only a reasonable likelihood of danger

*asap*

33

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

AMERICAN SOCIETY OF ACCESS PROFESSIONALS, INC.

## Exemption 8

Contained or relating to reports prepared by, or for, an agency responsible for regulation or supervision of financial institutions

*asap*

34

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

AMERICAN SOCIETY OF ACCESS PROFESSIONALS, INC.

## Exemption 9

Geological and geophysical information and data, including maps, concerning wells

Includes oil, gas, and water wells

*asap*

35

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

AMERICAN SOCIETY OF ACCESS PROFESSIONALS, INC.

## Questions?

Thanks for your participation!

*asap*

36

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---